

Sunnī-Shī‘ī Schism: A Brief Overview of the Arabic Sunnī Literature

Khaled Younes*

University of Sadat City, Egypt

Abstract: In Sunnī literature, the death of ‘Alī b. Abī Ṭālib (d. 40/661) marks the end of the era of the Righteous Caliphate (*al-khilāfa al-rāshida*), where caliphs were chosen through mutual consultation (*al-shūrā*), and the beginning of the hereditary monarchical rule (*al-mulk al-‘adūd*) introduced by Mu‘āwiya b. Abī Sufyān (r. 40-60/661-680) and continued throughout the Umayyads (40-132/661-750) and their Abbasid successors (132-656/750-1258). The Shī‘īs on the other hand considered ‘Alī the first of their divinely guided Imāms and the prophet’s rightful heir and true successor. This article provides a brief overview of the Sunnī-Shī‘ī split as represented in the Arabic Sunnī Literature.

Keywords: Early Islamic history, Sunna, Shī‘a, First Islamic Civil War (*al-fitna al-kubrā*), Second Islamic Civil War (*al-fitna al-thāniya*)

‘Alī b. Abī Ṭālib occupies an illustrious position in both Sunnī and Shī‘ī sources. He is always praised for his piety, justice, erudition and military prowess. ‘Alī is also known to have been the first (young) male convert to Islam and the prophet’s most intimate disciple. He participated in almost all military expeditions during the prophet’s lifetime, serving twice as commander and often as standard-bearer. He had also served the prophet as a secretary, missionary and diplomat. After the prophet’s death in 11/632, ‘Alī continued to play some role during the reign of the prophet’s successors, i.e., Abū Bakr *al-Ṣiddīq* (r. 11–13/632–634), ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb (r. 13–23/634–644) and ‘Uthmān b. ‘Affān (r. 23–35/644–656). The caliphate of ‘Uthmān ended with his assassination in 35/656 by a faction of disaffected tribesmen mostly from Egypt. ‘Alī was then elected as the new caliph (r. 35–40/656–661). As a close kinsman of the murdered caliph ‘Uthmān, Mu‘āwiya b. Abī Sufyān,¹ then governor of Syria, refused to pledge his allegiance to ‘Alī before exacting revenge on ‘Uthmān’s murderers. Although pledging allegiance to ‘Alī in Medina, Ṭalḥa b. ‘Ubayd Allāh (d. 36/656) and al-Zubayr b. al-‘Awwām (d. 36/656), two close companions of the prophet who were promised paradise, moved to Mecca and campaigned for vengeance for the blood of ‘Uthmān. Later, ‘Ā’isha (d. 58/678), daughter of the first caliph Abū Bakr and the prophet’s most-beloved wife, joined the latter two in Mecca, and all three marched in an army towards Basra. According to Sunnī historiography, al-Zubayr, Ṭalḥa and ‘Ā’isha supposedly did not form

* **Corresponding author: Khaled Younes** (Ph.D., Leiden University, 2013), Department of Tourism Guidance, Faculty of Tourism and Hotels, University of Sadat City, Egypt, khaled.younes@fth.usc.edu.eg

¹ See Hinds, M., “Mu‘āwiya I”, *EP*, 7, 263–268.

their alliance to challenge 'Alī's authority as caliph but rather to exact vengeance on the murderers of 'Uthmān and to achieve *iṣlāḥ* (reconciliation) in the Muslim *nation* whose unity was at stake. On the ground, the conflict escalated by the arrival of their army at the outskirts of Basra. All attempts to avoid any clashes between their army and 'Alī's were in vain when some soldiers of both sides were killed treacherously under the cover of darkness. This in turn led to the First Islamic Civil War (*al-fitna al-kubrā*) that included two consecutive battles: the Battle of the Camel,² also known as the Battle of Basra, that took place between 'Alī's army and the army of Ṭalḥa, al-Zubayr and 'Ā'isha in 36/656; and the Battle of Ṣiffīn between 'Alī's army and Mu'āwiya's Syrian army in 37/657.³ The Battle of the Camel ended in a victory for 'Alī's army while the Battle of Ṣiffīn ended in stalemate after submitting the dispute to arbitration that was doomed to failure. 'Alī's acceptance of arbitration led to the emergence of the Kharijites/*al-Khawārij* (the leavers/dissidents)⁴ in his army because they were locked on the military solution and considered the arbitration incompatible with God's judgment (*ḥukm Allāh*). They became fierce enemies to 'Alī and even declared him, Mu'āwiya and the two arbitrators, 'Amr b. al-Āṣ (d. 43/664) and Abū Mūsā al-Ash'arī (d. 52/672), as apostates. At last, 'Alī had to fight against some of his former adherents. The two armies met at al-Nahrawān⁵ on 9 Ṣafar 38/17 July 658, and the Kharijite army was crushed. A Kharijite rebel later assassinated 'Alī in 40/661.⁶ 'Alī's partisans (*Shī'at 'Alī*) then selected al-Ḥasan (d. 50/670), 'Alī's eldest son, to succeed his father. Few months later, al-Ḥasan stepped down in favor of Mu'āwiya who thus became the sole legitimate sovereign of the Muslim community and founded a hereditary dynasty that will rule for almost ninety years (41–132/660–750). The year 41/661 is highly venerated in Sunnī historiography as the “Year of Unity” (*‘ām al-jamā‘a*). Although the *fitna* was provisionally terminated by the resignation of al-Ḥasan, its consequences were in play. It ended the unity of the early Islamic nation (*umma*) by creating permanent theological disagreements that continue up to the present. This one nation split up into three: Sunnīs, Shī'īs and Kharijites. Each will later split into sects. For the Sunnī historians, the death of 'Alī marks the end of the era of the Righteous Caliphate (*al-khilāfa al-rāshida*), where caliphs were chosen through mutual consultation (*al-shūrā*),⁷ and

² So named because the battle took place around the camel on which 'Ā'isha was seated. For further details of the battle, see Veccia Vaglieri, L., “al-Djamal”, *EP*, 2, 414–416.

³ See Lecker, M., “Ṣiffīn”, *EP*, 9, 552–556; Hinds 1972, 93–129.

⁴ Levi Della Vida, G., “Khārijites”, *EP*, 4, 1074–1077.

⁵ Morony, M., “al-Nahrawān”, *EP*, 7, 912–913.

⁶ For a full biography of 'Alī, see al-Ya'qūbī, *Ta'riḥ* (1883), 1, 206–256; al-Ṭabarī, *Ta'riḥ* (1967–1971), 4, 427–575; 5, 5–163; Ibn al-Athīr, *al-Kāmil* (1987), 3, 81–274; Ibn Kathīr, *al-Bidāya wa-l-nihāya* (1990), 10, 411–686; 11, 5–142; Ibn 'Asākir, *Ta'riḥ madīnat Dimashq* (1995–2000), 42, 3–589 [no. 4933]; Ibn al-Imād, *Shadharāt al-dhahab* (1986–1993), 1, 200–227; Ibn al-Jawzī, *Mir'āt al-zamān* (2013), 6, 47–489; al-Mas'ūdī, *Murūj* (2005), 2, 273–331; Abū Nu'aym, *Ma'rifa al-ṣahāba* (1998), 2, 1968–1970 [no. 2026]; Ibn al-Athīr, *Uṣd al-ghāba* (2012), 871–888 [no. 3790]; Abū al-'Arab al-Tamīmī, *Kitāb al-Miḥan* (2006), 75–96; Ibn Qutayba, *al-Ma'arīf* (1981), 203–218; Khalīfa b. Khayyāṭ, *Ta'riḥ* (1985), 180–202; Ibn Ḥajar, *Taqrīb al-Tahdhīb* (2000), 698 [no. 4787]; Ibn al-Jawzī, *Ṣifat al-ṣafwa* (2012), 116–124; Ibn Sa'd, *Kitāb al-Ṭabaqāt al-kabīr* (2001), 2, 291–293; 3, 17–38; 8, 134; Ibn Qunfudh, *Kitāb al-Wafayāt* (1983), 28 [no. 40]; al-Dhahabī, *Ta'riḥ* (1990–2000), 3, 621–652; al-Dhahabī, *Tajrīd* (1985), 1, 392 [no. 4636]; al-Dhahabī, *Tahdhīb al-Kamāl* (2004), 6, 467–472 [no. 4790]; al-Dhahabī, *Duwal al-Islām* (1999), 1, 27–35; al-Dhahabī, *Siyar* (1981–1996), 225–285; Ibn Ḥajar, *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb* (1995), 3, 169–171; Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Isṭī'āb* (1992), 3, 1089–1133 [1855]; Ibn Ḥajar, *al-Iṣāba* (1853), 4, 269–271 [no. 5682]; al-Mizzī, *Tahdhīb al-Kamāl* (1980–1992), 20, 472–490 [no. 4089]. See also Veccia Vaglieri, L., “'Alī b. Abī Ṭalīb”, *EP*, 1, 381–386.

⁷ Ayalon, A., “Shūrā”, *EP*, 9, 504–506.

the beginning of the hereditary monarchical rule (*al-mulk al-‘aḏūd*) introduced by Mu‘āwiya and continued throughout the Umayyads and their Abbasid successors. The Shī‘īs on the other hand considered ‘Alī the first of their divinely guided Imāms and the prophet’s rightful heir and true successor. The accession of Yazīd b. Mu‘āwiya (r. 60–64/680–683) after his father’s death provoked a Second Civil War. Al-Ḥusayn b. ‘Alī (d. 61/680) and ‘Abd Allāh b. al-Zubayr (d. 73/692), son of al-Zubayr b. al-‘Awwām, withheld giving their pledge of allegiance to Yazīd’s governor of Medina and fled to Mecca under the cover of night to take refuge in the Sacred Sanctuary (*al-ḥaram*). ‘Alī’s partisans in Kūfa, the veterans of the first *fiṭna*, contacted al-Ḥusayn in Mecca and implored him to come to Kūfa to lead an uprising against the Umayyads. Al-Ḥusayn accepted the invitation and delegated his cousin Muslim b. ‘Aqīl (d. 60/680) to closely observe the situation in Kūfa and take the oath of allegiance (*al-bay‘a*) from the Kufan tribesmen on his behalf. Once Ibn ‘Aqīl reached Kūfa, Kufans flocked to welcome him and pledge allegiance to al-Ḥusayn. The supporters counted as many as eighteen thousand men. Ibn ‘Aqīl happily wrote to al-Ḥusayn urging him to hasten his departure. Accompanied by his household and a small group of loyal supporters, al-Ḥusayn moved from Mecca to Kūfa. The governor of Kūfa, al-Nu‘mān b. Bashīr (d. 65/685), a companion of the prophet, did not take action against the Kufan supporters of al-Ḥusayn. Instead, he ascended the pulpit and preached the people not to rush into discord and turmoil. The news reached Yazīd in Damascus who then dismissed al-Nu‘mān and appointed ‘Ubayd Allāh b. Ziyād (d. 67/686), then the ruler of Baṣra. He requested him to speedily arrest Muslim b. ‘Aqīl and kill him before the arrival of al-Ḥusayn. Ibn Ziyād reached Kūfa in disguise, wearing a black turban and veiled. He succeeded in deceiving the people of Kufa and its dismissed governor into believing that he is al-Ḥusayn, which leveraged him into securing full control over the governor’s residence (*dār al-imāra*). He then delivered a short incentive speech to the people gathered around the governor’s residence. He also summoned the tribal notables (*‘urafā*, sing. *‘arif*) asking them to discourage the people around Muslim b. ‘Aqīl. Driven by fear of Ibn Ziyād’s severe punishment as propagated by the tribal notables, al-Ḥusayn’s supporters began to disperse one after another and Muslim finally found himself literally alone that he could not even find anyone to guide him along the way. Later, he was caught and beheaded. Ibn Ziyād then sent a patrol of strong cavalry to block al-Ḥusayn’s way to Kūfa. The Umayyad troops forced al-Ḥusayn and his followers to entre in the desert plain of Karbalā’, located fifty miles to the northeast of Kūfa. With only tens of infantry and cavalry who refused to desert him, al-Ḥusayn took to the battlefield and fought heroically until he and most of his close relatives and loyal supporters met their inevitable death on the day of ‘Ashūrā’ (10 al-Muḥarram, 61/10 October, 680). His head was cut off and sent to Yazīd in Damascus. The women and children of his family were also taken to be presented before Yazīd. ‘Alī b. al-Ḥusayn known as Zayn al-‘Ābidīn (d. 95/713), who did not take part in the fight because of his illness, was the only son of al-Ḥusayn to survive the massacre. Al-Ḥusayn’s tragic death has not only triggered continuous rebellions against the Damascus-based Caliphate but also generated theological debates among the early Shī‘ī

community, which were to play a significant role in the formation of the Shī'ī identity. Shortly after al-Ḥusayn's death, two movements emerged: (1) the movement of the Penitents (*Tawwābūn*),⁸ established in 64–65/683–684 by a group of remorseful Shī'ī Kufans who profoundly blamed themselves for failing to support al-Ḥusayn at Karbalā', and (2) *al-Mukhtāriyya* (later developing into *al-Kaysāniyya*),⁹ led by al-Mukhtār b. Abī 'Ubayd al-Thaqafī between 66/686 and 67/687. These two movements, particularly the latter and its subsects, introduced some new concepts that later became fundamental creeds in Shī'ī belief, such as *al-Mahdī* (God-guided One),¹⁰ *badā'* (God's abrogation of His earlier decision),¹¹ *ghayba* (occultation),¹² and *raj'a* (return of the hidden Imām).¹³ These new theological and soteriological notions intensified the Sunnī-Shī'ī split and laid the foundations for the development of the early Shī'a to become sectarian.¹⁴

Bibliography

Primary Sources

- Abū al-'Arab al-Tamīmī, Muḥammad b. Aḥmad b. Tamīm (2006), *Kitāb al-Miḥan*, ed. by Y.W. Al-Jabbūrī, Beirut: Dār al-gharb al-islāmī.
- Abū Nu'aym, Aḥmad b. 'Abd Allāh al-Iṣbahānī (1998), *Ma'rifat al-ṣaḥāba*, ed. by 'Ā. al-'Azzāzī, 7 vols., Riyadh: Dār al-waṭan lil-nashr.
- al-Dhahabī (1981–1996), *Siyar a'lām al-nubalā'*, ed. by Sh. al-Arna'ūt *et al.*, 28 vols., Beirut: Mu'assasat al-risāla.
- al-Dhahabī (1990–2000), *Ta'rikh al-Islam wa-wafayāt al-mashāhīr wa-l-a'lām*, ed. by 'U.'A. Tadmurī, 53 vols., Beirut: Dār al-kitāb al-'arabī.
- al-Dhahabī (1999), *Duwal al-Islām*, ed. by Ḥ.I. Marwa/M. al-Arna'ūt, 2 vols., Beirut: Dār ṣādir.
- al-Dhahabī (2004), *Tadhīb Tahdhīb al-Kamāl fī asmā' al-rijāl*, ed. by Gh.A. Ghunaym *et al.*, 10 vols., Cairo: al-Fārūq al-ḥadītha lil-ṭibā'a w-l-nashr.
- al-Dhahabī, Shams al-Dīn Muḥammad b. Aḥmad b. 'Uthmān (1985), *Tajrīd asmā' al-ṣaḥāba*, 2 vols., Beirut: Dār al-ma'rifa lil-ṭibā'a w-l-nashr.
- Ibn al-Jawzī, Abū al-Muẓaffar Yūsuf b. Qiz'ughlī (2013), *Mir'āt al-zamān fī tawārīkh al-a'yān*, ed. by M. Barakāt *et al.*, 23 vols., Beirut: Dār al-risāla al-'ālamīyya.
- Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, Abū 'Umar Yūsuf b. 'Abd Allāh (1992), *al-Istī'āb fī ma'rifat al-aṣḥāb*, ed. by 'A.M. al-Bajāwī, 4 vols., Beirut: Dār al-jīl.

⁸ Denny, F.M., "Tawwābūn", *EP*, 10, 398.

⁹ Madelung, W., "Kaysāniyya", *EP*, 4, 836–838.

¹⁰ Madelung, W., "al-Mahdī", *EP*, 5, 1230–1238.

¹¹ Goldziher, I.,-[Tritton, A.S.], "Badā'", *EP*, 1, 850–851.

¹² Macdonald, D.B.,-[Hodgson, M.G.S.], "Ghayba", *EP*, 2, 1026.

¹³ Kohlberg, E., "Radj'a", *EP*, 8, 371–373.

¹⁴ For more about Sunnī-Shī'ī split, see Kohlberg 2016, xv–xxxvii; Hodgson 2016, 3–15; Crow 2016, 41–81; al-Qāḍī 2016, 169–193; Anthony 2012, 19–135; Shahin 2012, 177–208; Haider 2014, 32–39, 53–81, 85–86; Haider 2018, 209–222; Petersen 1964, 9–12, 28–51; 'Abbās 2017, 27–171; Madelung, W., "Shī'a", *EP*, 9, 420–424.

- Ibn al-Athīr (2012), *Usd al-ghāba fī ma'rifat al-ṣaḥāba*, Beirut: Dār Ibn Ḥazm.
- Ibn al-Athīr, Abū al-Ḥasan 'Alī b. Muḥammad (1987), *al-Kāmil fī al-ta'rīkh*, ed. by A. 'A. al-Qāḍī/M.Y. al-Daqqāq, 11 vols., Beirut: Dār al-kutub al-'ilmiyya.
- Ibn al-'Imād, Abū al-Falāḥ 'Abd al-Ḥayy b. Aḥmad (1986–1993), *Shadharāt al-dhahab fī akhbār man dhahab*, ed. by 'A. al-Arnā'ūt/M. al-Arnā'ūt, 10 vols., Damascus-Beirut: Dār Ibn Kathīr.
- Ibn al-Jawzī, Abū al-Faraj (2012), *Ṣifat al-ṣafwa*, ed. Kh.M. Ṭarṭūsī, Beirut: Dār al-kitāb al-'arabī.
- Ibn 'Asākir, Abū al-Qāsim 'Alī b. al-Ḥasan (1995–2000), *Ta'rīkh madīnat Dimashq wa-dhikr faḍlihā wa-tasmiyat man ḥallahā min al-amāthil aw ijtāz bi-nawāḥihā min wāridihā wa-ahlihā*, ed. by 'U. al-'Amrawī, 80 vols., Beirut: Dār al-fikr lil-ṭibā'a wa-l-nashr wa-l-tawzī'.
- Ibn Ḥajar (1853), *al-Iṣāba fī tamyīz al-ṣaḥāba*, 8 vols. + supplement, Calcutta.
- Ibn Ḥajar (1995), *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, ed. by I. al-Zaybaq/'Ā. Murshid, 4 vols., Beirut: Mu'assasat al-risāla.
- Ibn Ḥajar (2000), *Taqrīb al-Tahdhīb*, ed. by Ṣ.A.Sh. al-Bākistānī, Riyadh: Dār al-'āshima lil-nashr wa-l-tawzī'.
- Ibn Kathīr, Ismā'īl b. 'Umar (1997–1999), *al-Bidāya wa-l-nihāya*, ed. by 'A. 'A. al-Turkī, 21 vols., Cairo: Hajr lil-ṭibā'a wa-l-nashr wa-l-tawzī' wa-l-i'lān.
- Ibn Qunfudh, Abū al-'Abbās Aḥmad b. Ḥasan al-Qasantīnī (1983), *Kitāb al-Wafayāt*, ed. by 'A. Nuwayhid, Beirut: Dār al-āfāq al-jadīda.
- Ibn Qutayba, Abū Muḥammad 'Abd Allāh b. Muslim (1981), *al-Ma'ārif*, ed. by Th. 'Ukāsha, Cairo: Dār al-ma'ārif.
- Ibn Sa'd, Muḥammad b. Sa'd al-Zuhrī (2001), *Kitāb al-Ṭabaqāt al-kabīr*, ed. by 'A.M. 'Umar, 11 vols., Cairo: Maktabat al-Khanjī.
- Khalīfa b. Khayyāt (1985), *Ta'rīkh Khalīfa b. Khayyāt*, ed. by A.Ḍ. al-'Umarī, Riyadh: Dār ṭayba lil-nashr wa-l-tawzī'.
- al-Mas'ūdī, Abū al-Ḥasan 'Alī b. al-Ḥusayn (2005), *Murūj al-dhahab wa-ma'ādin al-jawhar*, ed. by K.Ḥ. Mar'ī, 4 vols., Beirut: al-Maktaba al-'aṣriyya.
- al-Mizzī, Yūsuf b. 'Abd al-Raḥmān (1980–1992), *Tahdhīb al-Kamāl fī asmā' al-rijāl*, ed. by B. 'A. Ma'rūf, 35 vols., Beirut: Mu'assasat al-risāla.
- al-Ṭabarī, Abū Ja'far Muḥammad b. Jarīr (1967–1971), *Ta'rīkh al-rusul wa-l-mulūk*, ed. by M.A. Ibrāhīm, 11 vols., Cairo: Dār al-ma'ārif.
- al-Ya'qūbī, Aḥmad b. Abī Ya'qūb b. Ja'far b. Wahb (1883), *Ta'rīkh al-Ya'qūbī*, ed. by M.Th. Houtsma, 3 vols., Leiden: Brill.

Secondary Literature

- ʿAbbās, Maryam R.W. (2017), *al-Thawarāt al-ʿalawiyya fī marwiyāt al-muʿarikhīn al-muslimīn ḥattā nihāyit al-ʿaṣr al-ʿAbbāsī al-awwal: qirāʾa jadīda wa-iʿādat taqwīm*, Karbala: al-ʿAtaba al-Ḥusayniyya al-muqaddasa.
- Anthony, Sean W. (2012), *The Caliph and the Heretic: Ibn Sabaʿ and the Origins of Shīʿism*, Leiden-Boston: Brill.
- Ayalon, A., “Shūrā,” *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd ed., 9, 504–506.
- Crow, Douglas K. (2016), “The Death of al-Ḥusayn b. ʿAlī and the Early Shīʿī Views of the Imamate,” in: Etan Kohlberg, ed., *Shīʿism, The Formation of the Classical Islamic World 33*, London-New York: Routledge, 41–86.
- Denny, F.M., “Tawwābūn,” *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd ed., 10, 398.
- Goldziher, I.,-[Tritton, A.S.], “Badāʾ,” *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd ed., 1, 850–851.
- Haider, Najam (2014), *Shīʿī Islam: An Introduction*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Haider, Najam (2018), “The Myth of the “Shīʿī Perspective”: Identity and Memory in Early Islam,” in: Herbert Berg, ed., *Routledge Handbook on Early Islam*, London-New York: Routledge, 209–222.
- Hinds, Martin (1972), “The Siffin Arbitration Agreement,” *Journal of Semitic Studies* 17/1: 93–129.
- Hinds, Martin, “Muʿāwiya I,” *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd ed., 7, 263–268.
- Hodgson, Marshall G.S. (2016), “How Did the Early Shīʿa Become Sectarian?,” in: Etan Kohlberg, ed., *Shīʿism, The Formation of the Classical Islamic World 33*, London-New York: Routledge, 3–15.
- Kohlberg, E., “Radjʿa,” *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd ed., 8, 371–373.
- Kohlberg, Etan (2016), “Introduction: Early Shīʿism in History and Research,” in: Etan Kohlberg, ed., *Shīʿism, The Formation of the Classical Islamic World 33*, London-New York: Routledge, xv–xxxvii.
- Lecker, M., “Ṣiffīn,” *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd ed., 9, 552–556.
- Levi Della Vida, G., “Khāridjites,” *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd ed., 4, 1074–1077.
- Macdonald, D.B.,-[Hodgson, M.G.S.], “Ghayba,” *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd ed., 2, 1026.
- Madelung, W., “al-Mahdi,” *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd ed., 5, 1230–1238.
- Madelung, W., “Kaysāniyya,” *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd ed., 4, 836–838.
- Madelung, W., “Shīʿa,” *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd ed., 9, 420–424.
- Morony, M., “al-Nahrawān,” *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd ed., 7, 912–913.
- Petersen, Erling Ladewig (1964), *ʿAlī and Muʿāwiya in Early Arabic Tradition: Studies on the Genesis and Growth of Islamic Historical Writing until the End of the Ninth Century*, Copenhagen: Munksgaard.

- Qāḍī, Wadād (2016), “The Development of the Term *Ghulāt* in Muslim literature with Special Reference to the Kaysāniyya,” in: Etan Kohlberg, ed., *Shī‘ism, The Formation of the Classical Islamic World* 33, London-New York: Routledge, 169–193.
- Shahin, Aram A., (2012) “In Defense of Mu‘āwiya ibn Abī Sufyān: Treatises and Monographs on Mu‘āwiya from the Eighth to the Nineteenth Centuries,” in: Paul M. Cobb, ed., *The Lineaments of Islam. Studies in Honor of Fred McGraw Donner. Islamic History and Civilization* 95, Leiden: Brill, 177–208.
- Veccia Vaglieri, L., “al-Djamal,” *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd ed., 2, 414–416.
- Veccia Vaglieri, L., “‘Alī b. Abī Ṭālib,” *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd ed., 1, 381–386.