

## A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations

Nouran Alaa El Deen Abd El Fattah Sobhy

Master Degree -Language & Translation Department

College of Languages & Communication

Arab Academy for Science, Technology & Maritime Transport - Egypt

[nouran.alaa@miuegypt.edu.eg](mailto:nouran.alaa@miuegypt.edu.eg)

Prof. Shaker Rizk Taky EIDin

Professor of Linguistics , English

Department

Faculty of Arts- Suez University – Egypt

[shaker115@yahoo.com](mailto:shaker115@yahoo.com)

Dr. Rania Magdy Fawzy

Lecturer in Linguistics, Language &

Translation Department

Arab Academy for Science, Tech- Egypt

[raniamagdi33@hotmail.com](mailto:raniamagdi33@hotmail.com)

### Abstract

Fairy tale animations are considered a very important and effective way to transfer values and ideas reflecting the producer's language and culture. Audiovisual translation is indisputably the most common form of the translation of the films for children. The objective of this study is to determine the strategies that play a significant role when subtitling and dubbing American animation songs for children in the Arab world. This study has a descriptive analytic approach. The study compares subtitled and dubbed versions of animation songs and addresses how the prosodic and phonic features are transferred into the target text with examples from songs of four animations subtitled into Modern Standard Arabic (MSA) and dubbed into the Egyptian Dialect (ED). Adopting Skopos Theory, the study explores problems of translating songs in fairy tale animations and the strategies adopted by the Arab translators in translating this genre. The research questions include: To what extent does the analyzed TT preserve the prosodic and phonic features of the ST? And what are the translation strategies used in the translated animated musical movies' song lyrics?

**Keywords:** skopos theory, audiovisual translation, dubbing, subtitling, fairy tale animations.

## Introduction

Audiovisual context is considered a very influential tool to transfer ideas, values and information. Cartoons are targeting child audience. When translating fairy tale animations, a translator is faced with a significant challenge due to the target audience nature and cultural background. The audiovisual context is considered polysemiotic as different semiotic modes are present simultaneously.

Translation of song lyrics poses an especially strong challenge in terms of retaining semantic closeness: according to Franzon, “a song translation that strives to be semantically accurate can hardly be sung to the music written for the original lyrics, and a song translation that follows the original music must sacrifice optimal verbal fidelity” (Franzon , 2005, p. 377).

Several studies of song translations have focused on the ways songs can actually be translated (Franzon, 2005 ; Low, 2008). Franzon (2005) identifies three properties of music – a melody, a harmonic structure, and an impression of meaning, mood or action, – which are particularly essential for the musico-textual fit in song translation (Franzon, 2005, p. 390) . Low (2008) examines translations of song lyrics in terms of the rhyme, sense, sing-ability, rhythm and naturalness “the pentathlon principle” (Low, 2008). The two authors demonstrated that musical features of a song play a crucial role in its translation.

Emphasis in animation songs is a function of prosodic and phonic elements rather than the “presentation of information as foregrounding or backgrounding, predictability and unpredictability” (Dickens et al., 2002, p.74). Both the prosodic and phonic elements serve as cohesive and coherent tool in animation songs.

The main objective of this study is to compare the subtitled and the dubbed versions of animation songs and to determine which strategies and procedures play a significant role in subtitling and dubbing songs for children in the Arab world. The focus of this study is on the sing-ability of Arabic translation of the animated songs.

How the prosodic and phonic features are dealt with in the subtitling and dubbing of animation songs, whether the translators are able or unable to reproduce the phonic and prosodic features of the original song and to what extent the subtitled and dubbed versions of animation songs are different.

## Questions of the Study

The main hypothesis of the study is that the translation strategies adopted by the Arab translator are constrained by the function and purpose of the TT. The meaning, the content, and what target texts are pointing to.

To test this hypothesis, the following research questions are formulated.

What are the problems and constraints that Arab translators face in English into Arabic subtitling and dubbing of animated songs?

To what extent are the subtitled and dubbed versions of animation songs different?

To what extent does the analyzed TT preserve the prosodic and phonic features of the SS?

What are the translation strategies used in the translated animated musical movies' song lyrics?

## Review of Literature and Theoretical Background

Franzon (2008) defines song as “a piece of music and lyrics – in which one has been adapted to the other, or both to one another – designed for a singing performance”(Franzon 2008, p. 376). Theoretically, this definition would mean that song translation is “a second version of a source song that allows the song’s essential values of music, lyrics and sung performance to be reproduced in a target language” (Franzon 2008, p. 376).

Franzon (2008) suggests that a song translator may choose to give priority to either the lyrics or the music, or to reach a compromise between the two, to achieve performability based on the assumption that “a song has three properties (music, lyrics and prospective performance) and music has three (melody, harmony and musical sense)” (Franzon , 2008). He named three aspects of music-textual fit as three layers of sing-ability: a prosodic match , a poetic match and a semantic-reflexive match (Franzon, 2008, p. 376). Considering music is such a complex system that can be challenging to translate, Low has formulated five criteria in order to satisfy the skopoi of a singable song: singability, sense, naturalness, rhythm, and rhyme (Low, 2003b, p. 92). These criteria form the basis of Low’s methodological framework, namely the “Pentathlon Principle”, where pentathlon functions as a metaphor for “juggling” or balancing the five criteria simultaneously.

Equivalence, in its simplest sense, refers to the relationship between the source text (ST) and the target text (TT) and is seen as what makes a TT a translation of a ST. Equivalence is a particular kind of adequacy, i.e. adequacy under the condition that the skopos requires that the source texts and target texts achieve the same function (Vermeer & Reiss, 2013, p. 128). Descriptive equivalence refers to the straightforward corresponding between ST and TT features, with no respect to the quality of the TT. On the other hand, Prescriptive equivalence refers to the relationship between a ST expression and the canonic TT rendering of it as required.

The most suitable theory which can be applied in song translation is Skopos theory as the aims and target culture needs are more important than the source song. Skopos theory was established by the German linguist Hans Vermeer in 1978 and it comprises the idea that translating and interpreting should primarily take into account the function of both the source and target text. Skopos is a Greek word for 'purpose'. Functionality (Skopos), is a theory which relies on reforming the source text resulting in production of a target text that in function is the same as the source text. So "knowing why a ST is to be translated and what the function of the TT will be are crucial for the translators" (Munday, 2008, p. 79). Domestication is "translating in a transparent, fluent, 'invisible' style in order to minimize the foreignness of the TT" (Munday, 2008, p. 144); here, the translator leaves the reader in peace and moves the ST towards him or her by making the translation as fluent as possible in the TT (Munday, 2008, p. 144).

Domestication is a process of cultural adaptation in which a certain cultural reference is replaced by another reference that is understood by the target audience. Domestication is considered as reader-centered and TT culture-oriented concept.

Foreignization, on the other hand, is seen as a strategy that excludes dominant cultural values in the target language; here, the translator leaves the writer in peace, and nudges the reader towards him or her (Munday, 2008, p. 145). Foreignization is considered as author-centered and ST culture-oriented concept. Foreignizing is writing in a completely smooth target-language leaving the reader wonder whether the text is a translation, or an original text that was written in target language. It is obvious that watching a subtitled film is a very different experience than watching a dubbed one.

When viewers are presented with a dubbed film, they can easily believe the illusion that what they are actually watching is an original domestic film (domesticating strategy i.e. ideology reflecting). Subtitles, on the other hand, allow the audience to hear the original dialogue and thus highlight the foreign identity of the source text (foreignizing strategy i.e. ideology forming). The translation of musical genre sets in the center of the wide spectrum ranging from extreme foreignization to extreme domestication.

In her thesis, *Dubbing Timon & Pumbaa Cartoon into Egyptian Arabic*, Al-Alami (2011) tackles the issue of translating and dubbing cartoons into Arabic using the Egyptian dialect. She argues that songs are being translated in an inaccurate way. The focus is mainly on creating a rhyming song in the TL without much consideration for faithfulness to the ST (Al-Alami, 2011, p. 53). Sometimes songs are even left without translation creating a different experience for the viewer and accentuating the foreignness of the cartoon while the rest of it is obviously too Egyptian to warrant leaving the song un-translated (Al-Alami, 2011, p. 53).

In a study comparing the micro and macro translational strategies adopted in two types of AVT, namely dubbing and fansubbing, the results indicate that the fansubbed version tends to adopt a foreignized macro strategy with the direct or literal translation strategy as the prime micro source language (SL) strategy, while the Egyptian colloquial Arabic dubbed version tends to adopt a domesticated macro strategy with the substitution strategy as the prime micro target language (TL) strategy (Allam, 2016).

## Methods and Procedures

English songs were taken from four animated movies produced by Walt Disney Company, and their translations were extracted from the Arabic subtitled and dubbed versions of the animations. These are 'Beauty and the Beast (1991)', 'Aladdin (1992)', 'The Lion King (1994)', and 'Tarzan (1999)'. They are available on DVDs subtitled and dubbed. Comparison between the translation of both the subtitled and the dubbed version was identified.

The analysis of the research material is based on Low's five criteria from the Pentathlon Principle: singability, sense, naturalness, rhythm and rhyme. Sense

and naturalness have been treated simultaneously since these two principles have to do with the semantic content of songs, while rhythm, rhyme have been analyzed together as prosodic and phonic elements of the translations.

For sense, the translator's micro-level decisions were analyzed by means of a taxonomy of 12 micro strategies developed by Schjoldager (2010b, p. 92). Regarding the prosodic elements of the song translations, the main concern when it comes to rhythm has been to investigate the syllables, the syllables of each translation unit have been counted to clearly illustrate if the number of syllables in the STs and the TTs coincide or not. Regarding the phonic elements of the song translations, rhyme was analyzed by counting and comparing the rhyming groups of the STs and the TTs.

The aim of paper has been to investigate to what extent and in what ways Low's Pentathlon principle has been observed in the subtitled and dubbed Arabic versions of the animated songs within the framework of Skopos theory.

## Analysis

**Song title** "You'll be in my heart", from *Tarzan* (1999)

<b>Source Text:</b> Come stop your crying It will be <b>alright</b> Just take my hand Hold it <b>tight</b>	
<b>Dubbed Version</b>	<b>Subtitled Version</b>
ياروحى تيكى دينتنا بخير هات يلا إيديك يلا نعيش	هيا كف عن البكاء ستكون الأمور على مايرام خذ بيدي وأمسكها بقوة
<b>Translation Procedure:</b> <b>Paraphrase</b>	<b>Translation Procedure: Direct translation</b>
<b>Analysis:</b> In the subtitled version, the translator used word for word translation. As for the dubbed version, the translator paraphrased "It will be alright" into دينتنا بخير (lit. Our life is fine). Although both clauses have similar semantic contents, the	

# A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations



<p>ST does not mention (life) at all as in dubbed TT. Addition of          يلا نعيش          was made for no obvious reason other than to keep the rhyme between          يلا نعيش / ماتبكيش          and create familiarity to the children watching the dubbed version.</p>	
<p><b>Source Text:</b>          I will protect you          From all around you          I will be here          Don't you cry</p>	
<p><b>Dubbed Version</b></p>	<p><b>Subtitled Version</b></p>
<p>قلبي نور يحميك          من الخوف و الليل          أنا وياك          ما تبكيش</p>	<p>سوف أحملك          من كل شئ حولك          سأكون معك هنا          فلا تبكى</p>
<p><b>Translation Procedure:</b>          Paraphrase</p>	<p><b>Translation Procedure: Direct translation</b></p>
<p><b>Analysis:</b>          In the dubbed version, the translator used paraphrase procedure to translate          “ I will protect you ” in the ST into          قلبي نور يحميك          (lit. My heart is light protects you), while addition was used in dubbing “from          all around you” into          من الخوف و الليل ( lit. From fear and night).          I believe that this can be interpreted as a culture reference to be more relevant to          the Arab children as it is commonly known that          الخوف والليل          are mostly scary in the Arab culture.          Rhyme between ايديك/ يحميك and أحملك / حولك</p>	

# A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations



**Song title** “Circle of life”, from *The Lion King* (1994)

## Source Text:

From the day we arrive on the planet  
And blinking, step into the sun  
There's more to see than can ever be seen  
More to do than can ever be done

## Dubbed Version

ده من أول نهار احنا عشناه  
الشمس دي سر الحياة  
الكون مليان بعجايب واشكال  
و بتزيد ع اللي نتمناه

## Subtitled Version

منذ أول نهار نحياه  
والشمس هي سر الحياة  
والعجائب لها عديد الأشكال  
وتزيد عما رجوناها

## Translation Procedure:

### Paraphrase

## Translation Procedure: Paraphrase

## Analysis:

“From the day we arrive on the planet” is subtitled into

منذ أول نهار نحياه

(lit. From the first day we lived), “And blinking, step into the sun” subtitled into

والشمس هي سر الحياة

(lit. the sun is the secret of life). The translator described the synonymous meanings , the sun confers life at the start of day on earth. This resembles the translations in the dubbed version “From the day we arrive on the planet” is dubbed into

ده من أول نهار احنا عشناه

(lit. From the first day we lived), “And blinking, step into the sun” is dubbed as

الشمس دي سر الحياة

(lit. The sun is the secret of life). The song is about appreciating life and taking in the wonders of this world. From the moment we open our eyes there are countless miracles to be witnessed in the world.

## Source Text:

There is far too much to take in here  
More to find than can ever be found  
But the sun rolling high  
Through the sapphire sky  
Keeps great and small on the endless round

# A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations



Dubbed Version	Subtitled Version
<p>أسرار تفوق خيال الناس حوالين كل شي نلقاه نور الشمس ومداه علي الارض ضياه ترسم فلكوكلنا جواه</p>	<p>اسرار تفوق الخيال لتفسير كل شئ نلقاه نور الشمس ومداه ينير الحياة يسعدنا كلما نراه</p>
<p><b>Translation Procedure:</b> <b>Paraphrase</b></p>	<p><b>Translation Procedure: Paraphrase</b></p>
<p><b>Analysis:</b> The translator in dubbed version maintain the rhyme between the last words of the four lines, i.e., نلقاه ,مداه, ضياه , جواه in expense of losing semantic content. “There is far too much to take in here” is subtitled into أسرار تفوق الخيال (lit. Secrets beyond imagination) and dubbed into أسرار تفوق خيال الناس (lit. Secrets beyond people’s imagination) and “More to find than can ever be found” is subtitled into لتفسير كل شئ نلقاه (lit. To explain everything we meet) and dubbed into حوالين كل شي نلقاه (lit. About everything we meet). There is just too much of things to be seen or done in a lifetime on Earth. The Sun is the main source of life on Earth. The circle of life continues through each one of us, making this world come to life and death and life again forever and ever “the endless round.” dubbed as ترسم فلك و كلنا جواه (lit. Draw a sphere and all of us inside it).</p>	
<p><b>Source Text:</b> It’s the circle of life And it moves us all Through despair and hope Through faith and love</p>	

# A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations



<p>Till we find our place On the path unwinding In the circle The circle of life</p>	
Dubbed Version	Subtitled Version
<p>دي دايرة الحياة ودي دايرة ابدية تحضنا جواها ووجودنا في حماها سايئانا وياها في رحلة ابدية في الدايرة في دايرة الحياة</p>	<p>دائرة الحياة دائرة أبدية لا نعرف مداها نحظى بحماها نتبع خطاها اللانهائية دائرة أبدية دائرة الحياة دائرة الحياة</p>
<b>Translation Procedure: Oblique translation</b>	<b>Translation Procedure: Oblique translation</b>
<p><b>Analysis:</b> The translator has changed the meaning of the source text. But despite this change in meaning, the original message of the lyric has been preserved in the translation. The translator had used a sense-for-sense translation procedure, explaining the meaning of the lyrics in subtitling and dubbing. The circle of life is a symbolic term for the series of events that unfolds on earth. The circle of life described as “ And it moves us all”, “Through despair and hope”, “Through faith and love”, “Till we find our place” in ST and in dubbed version, the circle of life is</p> <p>دى دايرة أبدية (lit. It is an eternal circle) تحضنا جواها (lit. Embrace us inside it), ووجودنا فى حماها (lit. And our presence is because it protects us), سايئانا وياها (lit. Leads us with it).</p> <p>Mufasa is the Lion King -all other animals in the savannah are under his sovereignty- and he presents his new-born son Simba to the crowds. The animals of all shapes and sizes traveling to Simba's presentation. Although they're all extremely different, these animals exist together in a peaceful and</p>	

# A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations



beautiful harmony that mirrors the circle of life itself. The animals wordlessly moving towards Pride rock where Mufasa was standing .At the end of the song, sun slices through the clouds to bless baby Simba, held skyward by the monkey Rafiki, and all animals bow to him. The images support and reinforce the information provided through the ST lyrics.

Rhyme between

جواها , حماها , وياها

**Song title** “A whole new world ”, from *Aladdin* (1992)

## Source Text

I can show you the world  
Shining, shimmering, splendid

## Dubbed Version

هاتى ايديك  
هنشوف دينا جديدة بتلمع

## Subtitled Version

يمكننى ان أريك العالم  
يضئ ويومض بشكل بديع

## Translation Procedure: Paraphrase

## Translation Procedure: Direct translation

## Analysis:

The phrase “I can show you the world” is dubbed into ED as هاتى ايديك (lit. Give me your hands). The phrase “Shining, shimmering, splendid” is dubbed into هنشوف دينا جديدة بتلمع

(lit. We will see a shining new world). Using paraphrase in these two lines suits the common saying of the Arabic culture and conveys the message to the Arabic children audience. The dubbed version tends to be quite domesticated with most of the micro translational strategies are target-text oriented. The dubber by adopting paraphrase, gets the foreign source text in the vicinity of the target language realm, and thus to the target audience as well. The main idea is transferred with some sense manipulation.

In subtitled version, the translator used word to word translation procedure.

## Source Text

Tell me princess now  
When did you last let your heart decide?

## Dubbed Version

ياأميرة  
امتى قلبك كان ليكى يوم دليل ؟

## Subtitled Version

أخبرينى ياأميرة  
متى آخر مرة جعلت قلبك يقرر؟

# A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations



Translation Procedure: Paraphrase	Translation Procedure: Direct translation
<p><b>Analysis:</b>                      “Tell me, princess now” was dubbed as                      يَا أَمِيرَةَ                      (lit. O Princess). The two words ‘Tell me’ and ‘Now’ was deleted from the dubbed version.                      The phrase “When did you last let your heart decide?”                      was dubbed as                      اَمْتِي قَلْبِكَ كَان لِيَكِي يَوْم دَلِيل ؟                      (lit. At what time your heart was guiding you?)                      The translator used the word                      دَلِيل                      which means to show or indicate the way to someone, to convey the meaning of taking a decision. In subtitled version word to word procedure was used.</p>	
<p><b>Source Text</b>                      I can open your eyes                      Take you wonder by wonder</p>	
Dubbed Version	Subtitled Version
<p>سَيِّبِي قَلْبِكَ لِيَا                      وَيَشُوف دِينَا عَجِيْبَة</p>	<p>يَمَكْنَنِي أَنْ أَفْتَح عَيْنِيكَ                      أَنْفَلِكَ مِنْ أَعْجُوبَة إِلَى أُخْرَى</p>
Translation Procedure: Paraphrase	Translation Procedure: Direct translation
<p><b>Analysis:</b>                      “I can open your eyes” is dubbed into                      سَيِّبِي قَلْبِكَ لِيَا                      (lit. Leave our heart with me)                      and “Take you wonder by wonder” is dubbed into                      وَيَشُوف دِينَا عَجِيْبَة                      (lit. See wondrous world). Aladdin tries to fulfill Princess Jasmine’s happiness by taking her on a magic carpet ride and serenading her. The song is having imaginative theme and it is really a great portrayal of falling in love, it also parallels Princess Jasmine’s desire for freedom.                      In subtitled version, the translator used word to word translation procedure.</p>	
<p><b>Source Text</b>                      Over, sideways and under</p>	

# A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations



On a magic carpet ride	
<b>Dubbed Version</b>	<b>Subtitled Version</b>
دينا بعيدة وقريبة على البساط السحري نطير	من الأعلى والجانب وإلى أسفل بجولة على البساط السحري
<b>Translation Procedure: Paraphrase</b>	<b>Translation Procedure: Direct translation</b>
<p><b>Analysis:</b>  “Over, sideways and under” is paraphrased as  دينا بعيدة وقريبة  (lit. A far and near world) in the dubbed version. Aladdin knows that Jasmine has never been on a magic carpet ride because she has always been living in the palace. Jasmine had to experience this with Aladdin; this made their love even stronger. In subtitled version, the translator used word to word translation procedure.</p>	

**Song title** “Be our guest”, from *Beauty and the Beast* (1991)

<b>Source Text:</b> Be our guest Be our guest	
<b>Dubbed Version</b>	<b>Subtitled Version</b>
عشوة إيش عشوة إيش	كونى ضيفتنا كونى ضيفتنا
<b>Translation Strategy: Addition</b>	<b>Translation Strategy: Direct translation</b>
<p><b>Analysis:</b>  The phrase “Be our guest” is dubbed as  عشوة إيش  (lit. A luxurious dinner) and subtitled literally as  كونى ضيفتنا  The Arabic dubber resorted to a total exchange of meaning, whereby the TT phrasing is entirely different from the ST phrasing. Nevertheless, there is a logical connection of meanings between the two phrasings. If we listen to the introduction in the ST, it says: “And now we invite you to relax, let us pull up a chair as the dining room proudly presents - your dinner!” This was dubbed as:</p>	

# A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations



<p>والآن مطلوب منك الأسترخاء وبنسحبلك كرسي على ما أودة السفرة تتدم بفخر - عشاكي                  The sense was reflected, a dinner is served to a guest. In Egyptian dialect (ED) إيش                  is a term used to describe something luxurious, by using this familiar Arabic term the meaning is clarified and made easier for children audience.</p>		
<p><b>Source Text:</b>                  Put our service to the test</p>		
<b>Dubbed Version</b>		<b>Subtitled Version</b>
من طعامتها الودن <b>توش</b>		واختبرى خدماتنا
<b>Translation</b>	<b>Strategy: Addition</b>	<b>Translation Strategy: Direct translation</b>
<p><b>Analysis:</b>                  The phrase “Put our service to the test” is translated into MSA as واختبرى خدماتنا which is a literal translation.                  But, it is dubbed into من طعامتها الودن توش (lit. Tasty to cause noise in your ears) in Egyptian dialect (ED) which is completely different, but suits the common saying of the Arabic culture and conveys the message to the Arabic children audience.</p>		
<p><b>Source Text:</b>                  Tie your napkin ‘round your neck, Cherie</p>		
<b>Dubbed Version</b>		<b>Subtitled Version</b>
حتى الفوطة يا نطنوطة		اربطى منديلك حول عنقك ياعزيزتى
<b>Translation</b>	<b>Strategy: Paraphrase</b>	<b>Translation Strategy: Direct translation</b>
<p><b>Analysis:</b>                  “Tie your napkin round your neck, Cherie,” is dubbed as حتى الفوطة يا نطنوطة (lit. Put on the napkin, Kitty). The translation was word for word translation in subtitling.                  اربطى منديلك حول عنقك ياعزيزتى                  The word نطنوطة is used in ED when talking to a lovely little girl. This local referent replaces the</p>		

# A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations



word “Cherie” in the dubbing. Moreover, “napkin” is dubbed to the ED equivalent فوطية The meaning is easily determined from the context.	
<b>Source Text:</b> And we’ll provide the rest	
<b>Dubbed Version</b>	<b>Subtitled Version</b>
على ما اللحمية الزبدة تطش	ونحن سوف نتكفل بالبقية
<b>Translation Strategy:</b> <b>Addition</b>	<b>Translation Strategy: Direct translation</b>
<p>Analysis:</p> <p>“And we provide the rest” is dubbed as على ما اللحمية الزبدة تطش (lit. As the butter sizzles over the meat)</p> <p>One reason for using addition in the translation of these lines may be attributed to phonic matters. The translator has made rhyme between the last words of the three lines, i.e., إش / توش / تطش in expense of losing semantic content.</p> <p>“Put our service to the test” is dubbed as من طعامتها الودن توش</p> <p>In the source song, the kitchen tools want Belly to test their service, cooking, food preparation, singing, and dancing. They didn’t mention an opinion regarding the food, but in the dubbed version, a comment on the taste is added. The translator did that to keep the rhyme of the song. Preserving rhyme is a priority in animation songs dubbing. “And we provide the rest” is dubbed as على ما اللحمية الزبدة تطش</p> <p>The English phrase means that Belly has to prepare herself only and everything will be served to her table; she has to wait for a while for the food to served hot. The same sense is reflected in the dubbed version with one small addition. It describes the kind of food that is being cooked while maintaining the rhyme in the song. توش / تطش</p>	

## Sense

In translation, the transfer of sense is one of the main priorities. However, in the case of song translation the concept of sense transfer has to be more flexible than in other types of translation. As Franzon (2008) explains: “A song translation that strives to be semantically accurate can hardly be sung to the music written for the original lyrics, and a song translation that follows the original music must sacrifice optimal verbal fidelity” (Franzon, 2008, p. 376).

Regarding the transfer of sense, the subtitles tend to reflect it accurately. Direct translation is the most common strategy found in the subtitles analyzed. The subtitled version reveals that it tends to be quite foreignized. With most of the micro translational strategies are source-text oriented, the subtitler gets the target audience as close and familiar as possible to the source text by adopting direct and word for word translation.

The analysis of the dubbed version demonstrates that this version tends to be quite domesticated. With most of the micro translational strategies are target-text oriented, the dubber by adopting paraphrase, gets the foreign source text in the vicinity of the target language realm, and thus to the target audience as well. In dubbing songs, direct linguistic transfer as such is unusual.

However, the main idea tends to be transferred in the dubbed songs, although there are some cases of sense manipulation. Considering the Skopos of subtitles, these findings indicate that sense has been of high priority in subtitling since the translators have made subtitled lyrics similar semantically to their source lyrics.

## **Rhythm**

This is one of the most important elements in song translation. The analysis of rhythm has observed if the number of sung syllables in the source lyrics coincides with the number of sung syllables in the subtitled and dubbed songs, as well as observing if the musical stress falls on the same notes. The prosodic elements would be sacrificed in subtitling and prioritized in dubbed translations.

The dubbed lyrics are hence singable as expected based on the skopos of singable song translations. It is important that the rhythm is preserved. In order to preserve rhythm, other elements may be sacrificed as the linguistic content.

The analysis shows that the dubbed lyrics are more similar to their source lyrics when it comes to number of syllables than the subtitled lyrics.

There is no identical pattern of sentence stress even if there is similar number of syllables between the subtitled lyrics and source song lyrics. These subtitled TTs don't follow the melody of their STs, and that they therefore are difficult to sing along with. This indicates that rhythm has not been the top priority for the subtitlers while it has been of high priority for the translators of the dubbed lyrics.

Rhythm seems to be one of the main priorities in singable song translation. Most of the dubbed songs reproduce the original rhythmic pattern, the slight distortions observed tend to be related to introducing more syllables in the translated songs. The subtitles analyzed are not meant to be singable, thus they do not attempt to preserve the source song rhythm.

## **Rhyme**

The dubbed lyrics have a larger proportion of coincident rhyming lines with the source song lyrics than the subtitled lyrics. The focus is mainly on creating a rhyming song in the dubbed version without much consideration for faithfulness to the source song. The subtitles songs are not designed to be sung.

The general approach towards rhyme observed in the Arabic subtitles is not to maintain it. This decision makes the translating activity less constrained. The analysis reveals that rhyme is not taken into account in the subtitles. The translator does not endeavour to maintain the rhyming patterns in the Arabic subtitles. Therefore, the rhythm, poetic and musical features are lost in Arabic subtitles and the target audience would not experience the same influence as that of the source audience.

Although rhyme is taken into consideration in the dubbed songs, the original rhyme-pattern does not tend to be reproduced. In this sense, it seems that preserving the SS rhyme-pattern is not one of the main priorities when dubbing or subtitling the songs analyzed. The analysis shows that whilst rhyme is present in the dubbed songs analyzed, the rhyme-scheme is generally not preserved.

Most of the translation units of the dubbed songs analyzed show partial preservation of the rhyme-scheme of the source lyrics and add more rhyming lines in the translation. Some translation units do not mirror the rhyming pattern of the original song. The units that replicate exactly the rhyme-scheme of the source song are less. The dubbed lyrics have more rhyming groups than the subtitled lyrics. This was expected since singable song translators often put a lot of emphasis on rhyme and at the same time rhymes are not important in subtitling considering the audience is only able to read one caption at a time. The MSA subtitled and ED dubbed TTs differ when it comes to prosodic and poetic features. The dubbed TTs are hence singable as expected based on the skopos of singable song translations. While the translators of the subtitled TTs have prioritized sense, the prosodic principles of rhythm and rhyme have been the main concern for the translators of the dubbed TTs. The prosodic elements have thus to a greater extent been sacrificed in the subtitled TTs, while sense has been sacrificed in the dubbed TTs.

Culture-specific items (CSIs) is one of problematic issues in translation, as being specific and limited to a certain culture and pertinently to a certain language. Cultural transplantation is the most common strategy used for translation of CSIs in dubbed version. In subtitled version most of CSIs are translated literally. The metaphor “He is not whole without a soul to wait upon” is a verse from the song “Be our Guest”. The kitchen tools are actually the servants of the prince. These servants were turned into kitchen tools by the witch in the animation film. There is personification in this metaphor using some of humans’ attributes, such as, waiting and the pronoun he to refer to one of the kitchen tools. There are emotional connotations of the word “soul” and the use of the verb “wait” instead of serve in comparing a master to a soul “without a soul to wait upon”.

This implies the kind of the relationship between the master and his servants, the servants (the tools) feel happy serving their master, they wait for this moment to come. This metaphor translates as

مش موجود من غير ما سيد يتولو هات

The sense that the servants are not forced to serve is lost in using the imperative verb

هات

(lit. Give) and this sense was compensated by

مش موجود

(lit. Not present)

This implies that if the tools are not serving, they do not exist. The emotional connotations of the word “soul” are not reflected by the word

سيد

(lit. Master) but literal translation of “soul” is not appropriate, so the gain in Arabic version aimed to be more clear for the young audience who may be puzzled by the word “soul” . In the translation of this metaphor, dynamic equivalent is used to create an equivalent effect on the target audience.

## Conclusion

The purpose of this study is to examine how the songs that belong to the Disney fairy tale animations are translated into Arabic. This thesis has explored how these songs are subtitled and dubbed into MSA and ED and has observed the differences between subtitled and dubbed lyrics. The aim of this paper has been to investigate to what extent and in what ways Low’s Pentathlon Principle has been observed in the subtitled and dubbed Arabic versions of the songs.

Regarding the transfer of sense, the subtitles tend to reflect it accurately. Direct translation is present in the majority of the subtitled segments analyzed. It is concluded that the tendency of the translators of the subtitled version was more towards a source-text oriented translation. This indicates that the subtitler resorts to the safest translational haven.

Paraphrase is present in the majority of the dubbed segments analyzed. It is concluded that the tendency of the translators of the dubbed version was more towards a target-text oriented translation.

This points out that the dubber manipulates the translational techniques so as to render the dubbed version quite adequate and acceptable to the target recipient. In dubbed lyrics, meaning was sacrificed so as to have the best possible rhythmic and rhymed forms, while in subtitled lyrics, the rhythmic and singable forms were sacrificed so as to have the most correct rendering of meaning. This study has shown that it is essential to assess the impact of non-linguistic elements when analyzing the translation of songs in audiovisual contents - not only in dubbing, but also in subtitling.

## Limitation & Recommendation

Studies undertaken in AVT in the Arab world are scarce, compared to studies on written translation. Thus, the study will hopefully, pave the way for future research in this particular area. The data of the study is limited to two translated versions of six songs only. This does not allow for forming reliable generalizations. However, the analysis and results might provide general considerations that form the basis for future research conducted specifically on audiovisual contents. Data collection has been restricted by the limited number of professionally- subtitled and dubbed animated movies. As this particular study highlights the difference between MSA subtitled and ED dubbed version in song translation, It has to be further investigated which varieties of Arabic language are more dominant in dubbing and subtitling and what extent they may influence the process of song translation.

## References:

- Al-Alami, B.N.(2011). Dubbing Timon&Pumbaa Cartoon into Egyptian Arabic (MA thesis) .American University of Sharjah.Retrieved from<https://dspace.aus.edu:8443/xmlui/bitstream/handle/11073/2719/29.232-2011.12%20Budor%20Al%20Alami.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>
- Allam, R. (2016) . Assessing Three Audiovisual Translated Versions of Toy Story 1: A Functional Approach.Occasional Papers in the Development of English Education ,62 (1) , 247-296. Retrieved from [https://journals.ekb.eg/article\\_86794\\_07994e000e58749d112ec6834953fe82.pdf](https://journals.ekb.eg/article_86794_07994e000e58749d112ec6834953fe82.pdf)
- Dickens, J., Hervey, S. & Higgins, I. (2002). Thinking Arabic Translation: A course in translation method:Arabic to English(1st Edition).London:Routledge.
- Franzon , J. (2005). Musical comedy translation: Fidelity and format in the Scandinavian My Fair Lady. In: D.L.Gorlee (Ed.), Song and Significance: Virtues and Vices of Vocal Translation (pp. 263-297). Amsterdam& New York: Rodopi.

# A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations



- 
- Franzon, J. (2008). Choices in Song Translation: Singability in Print, Subtitles and Sung Performance. *The Translator*, 14 (2), 373–399.
  - Low, P. (2003b). Singable Translations of Songs. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 11(2), 87-103. Retrieved from  
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/0907676X.2003.9961466>
  - Low, P. (2008). Translating Songs that Rhyme. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 16(1-2),1-20. Retrieved from  
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13670050802364437>
  - Munday, J. (2008). *Introducing Translation Studies, Theories and Applications*(2nd Edition). London & New York: Routledge.
  - Schjoldager, A.G. (2010b). Microstrategies. In: A. Schjoldager, H. Gottlieb, & I. Klitgård (Eds), *Understanding Translation*(pp. 89-112).Denmark:Academica.
  - Vermeer, H. J. & Reiss, K. (2013). *Towards a general theory of translational action: skopos theory explained*(1st Edition)(C. Nord, Trans.).London & New York: Routledge.

تحليل تقابلي للترجمة العربية لبعض الأغاني الأمريكية المدبلجة والمترجمة  
من الحكايات الخيالية في أفلام الرسوم المتحركة

نوران علاء الدين عبد الفتاح صبحي

باحثة ماجستير- قسم اللغة والترجمة

كلية اللغة والأعلام، الأكاديمية العربية للعلوم والتكنولوجيا والنقل البحري، مصر

[nouran.alaa@miuegypt.edu.eg](mailto:nouran.alaa@miuegypt.edu.eg)

دكتورة رانيا مجدى فوزى

مدرس اللغويات

كلية اللغة والأعلام، الأكاديمية العربية للعلوم

والتكنولوجيا والنقل البحري، مصر

[raniamagdi33@hotmail.com](mailto:raniamagdi33@hotmail.com)

الأستاذ الدكتور شاکر رزق تقى الدين

أستاذ اللغويات

كلية الآداب، جامعة السويس، مصر

[shaker115@yahoo.com](mailto:shaker115@yahoo.com)

**المستخلص:**

تعتبر أفلام الرسوم المتحركة الخيالية وسيلة فعالة وفي غاية الأهمية لنقل القيم والأفكار التي تعكس لغة منتج العمل وثقافته. إن الترجمة السمعية والبصرية هي بالتأكيد أكثر أشكال ترجمة أفلام الأطفال شيوعاً. الهدف من هذه الدراسة هو تحديد الاستراتيجيات التي تلعب دوراً مهماً عند الترجمة المرئية ودبلجة أغاني الرسوم المتحركة الأمريكية للأطفال في العالم العربي. الغرض من هذه الدراسة هو تقديم تحليل وصفي لمجال ترجمة الأغاني من اللغة الإنجليزية إلى العربية، إذ تقارن الدراسة بين الإصدارات المترجمة مرئياً والمدبلجة لأغاني الرسوم المتحركة وتتناول كيفية ترجمة السمات الصوتية والسمعية إلى النص المستهدف بأمثلة من أغاني الرسوم المتحركة لأربعة أفلام مترجمة مرئياً إلى اللغة العربية الفصحى الحديثة (MSA) ومدبلجة باللهجة المصرية (ED). واعتماداً على نظرية سكوبوس (نظرية الهدف)، توضح الدراسة مشاكل ترجمة الأغاني في أفلام الرسوم المتحركة للقصص الخيالية والاستراتيجيات التي يعتمد عليها المترجمون العرب في ترجمة هذا النوع، وخلصت الدراسة إلى أن اتجاه مترجمي النسخة المترجمة مرئياً كان نحو الترجمة الموجهة للنص المصدر بشكل أكبر، في حين أن مترجمي النسخة المدبلجة يتجهون أكثر نحو الترجمة الموجهة للنص المستهدف. وفي الكلمات المدبلجة، تم التخلي عن المعنى للحصول على أفضل أشكال إيقاعية ومُقافية ممكنة، بينما في الكلمات المترجمة مرئياً، تم التخلي عن الأشكال الإيقاعية والغنائية من أجل الحصول على المعنى الصحيح. وتشمل أسئلة البحث ما يلي: إلى أي مدى يحافظ النص المستهدف المُحَلَّل على السمات الصوتية والسمعية للنص المصدر؟ وما هي استراتيجيات الترجمة المستخدمة في ترجمة كلمات أغاني أفلام الرسوم المتحركة الموسيقية؟

**الكلمات الدالة:** نظرية سكوبوس، الترجمة السمعية البصرية، الدبلجة، الترجمة المرئية، الحكايات الخيالية في أفلام الرسوم المتحركة.