Relationship between Civility Behavior and Classroom Engagement among Nursing Students

Eman Hassan Mohamed (1), Mona Mostafa Shazly(2), Heba Ali Hassan (3)

- (1) Master degree of Nursing Administration, Faculty of Nursing, Ain Shams University.
- (2) Professor of Nursing Administration, Faculty of Nursing, Ain Shams University.
- (3) Assistant Professor of Nursing Administration, Faculty of Nursing, Ain Shams University.

Abstract

Background: Civility behavior of students is a very valuable topic in higher education. It changes the teaching and learning environment by improving both student and faculty staff engagement and has positively effect on the learning outcomes. The aim of this study was to assess the relationship between civility behavior and classroom engagement among nursing students. Subject& method: Design: descriptive correlational design was used in this study. Setting: The study was conducted at Faculty of Nursing - Ain Shams University., Subjects: all available nursing students (200) at 1st scholar year during the data collection period at academic year (2019-2020). The convenient sample was utilized in conducting of this study. Tools: The data were collected by using 2 tools Incivility in Nursing Education (INE) Questionnaire, National Survey of Student Engagement (NSSE). The results of the study revealed that more than half of nursing students had uncivil behavior while less than one third of nursing students had civil behavior. In addition, that two fifth of nursing students had low level of classroom engagement while less than half of nursing students had high level of classroom engagement. The conclusion: The study findings concluded that there was highly statistically significant relation between nursing students' civility behavior level and all classroom engagement level. The recommendation: Based on the study findings, it was recommended that develop innovative teaching learning strategies to improve the student engagement in the classroom, and conduct the orientation for newly enrolled students should include clearly civility behavior guidelines

Key words: civility behavior, classroom engagement, nursing students.

Introduction

Common civility is becoming a lost art. In busy and complex lives, simple gestures of politeness, such as smiling or saying "thank you," have become uncommon occurrences. Civility is a form of goodness; it is gracious goodness. But it is not just an attitude of good and thoughtful relating to other individuals; it also entails an active interest in the wellbeing of our communities and even a concern for the health of the primary on which we live (**Keating**, 2016).

Civility behavior has an important role in developing engagement, and higher education plays a special role in helping student develop a sense of civic responsibility. So, the classroom is a place where learning can take place in a positive environment, Academic institutions' primary mission focuses on learning. In addition to the relationship that civility has with learning in the academy, the consequences of nursing student civility on students and their engagement (Mohamed & Attia, 2020).

Civility must be major characteristic of higher education. especially in nursing education. There are several examples of civility behavior in the follow classroom as: classroom good conversation in manner. permission to tape record and respect the faculty staff's decision to allow or disallow, avoid verbal and restrict from use the internet during classroom time. In addition, listen respectfully to each other and be ready to be actively engaged in the learning process (Estell & Perdue, 2013).

Engagement is an important or an eminent academic orientation that accepts pig and expanded attention of learners and researchers. Engagement as a passage to better unfriendliness, to turn away learner dullness and dissatisfaction, to increase students' encouragement, push. involvement in college regarding performance, to enhance accomplished successful learner attainment standard, and to support students' self-confident and favorable development. Engagement is also a worthy or a precious form of grasp the progressive method by which students drop out of college (Oqab et al., 2016).

Student engagement is defined as a student's initiation of effort, action, and persistence in schoolwork as well as his ambient emotional states during learning activities (Ouweneel, Le Blanc, & Schaufeli, 2014). Also, it's the energy and time a student devotes to educational sound activities outside and inside classrooms, practices, and policies that educational institutions use to encourage the student to participate in these activities (Mo & Singh, 2018).

Creating a culture of civility requires communication, interaction and an appreciation for the interests each student brings to the relationship. When nursing faculty and students encounter one another and take advantage of opportunities to engage, discuss, and actively listen to one another, a culture of respect and the civility are fostered. Conversely, if opportunities for student and faculty engagement are missed, avoided, or poorly managed, a culture incivility of is cultivated and the disrespect persists. Although interaction between students and faculty are constantly occurring (Clark et al., 2015).

Significance of the Study

Incivility behavior interferes with academic performance achievement and leads to a decline curve of engagement for nursing students. Based on the study findings, recommended that set and activate policies of civility behaviors and

needed to make further study to explore the investigate effect of civility behaviors on student performance achievement and engagement (Mohamed, 2018).

The researcher observed that some of nursing students perform certain incivility behaviors as arriving class late, leaving class early, lack student-faculty staff interaction and using cell phone during the lecture. So, this phenomenon should be addressed and investigated to assess the relationship between civility behavior and classroom engagement among nursing students

Aim of the study:

This study aims at assessing the relationship between civility behavior and classroom engagement among nursing students.

Research Hypothesis:

There is relationship between civility behavior and classroom engagement among nursing students.

Research design:

A descriptive, correlational design used in this study.

Research setting:

The study was conducted at Faculty of Nursing- Ain Shams University, at 1st scholar year

Subjects:

Convenient sample was utilized in conducting of this study, the subjects for the study included all available nursing students (200) at 1st scholar year during the data collection period at academic year (2019-2020).

Tools of data collection

Data for this study were collected by using two tools, namely, Incivility in Nursing Education (INE) Questionnaire, and National Survey of Student Engagement (NSSE)

1. Incivility in Nursing Education (INE) Questionnaire

This tool consisted of two parts. The first part was concerned with data about the sociodemographic characteristics of nursing students, such as gender, birth

order, education level of both mother and father etc..

The second part was developed by 2009) and adopted (Clark, (Mahmoud, 2015). It aimed to assess nursing students' level of civility behavior in the classroom, the frequent occurrence of these behaviors. It included of student civility behaviors and the perceived frequency of these behaviors which consisted of 40 statements under two sections covering different aspects of civility behavior. They were student disruptive behaviors (24 items), and student threatening behaviors (16 items).

❖ Scoring system

Responses of participants were measured on 5 points likert scale ranged from very civil, civil, uncertain, uncivil, and very uncivil .Very civil was scored as "5", while very uncivil was scored as "1".The negative words got reversed score. All items are summed up and converted into percent scores. Uncivil if the mean percentage score was <60%, uncertain 60-75.0% and civil if > 75.0%.

2. National Survey of Student Engagement (NSSE):

This tool developed by (NSSE, 2017). It aimed to assess level of nursing students' engagement. It was included (5) basic dimensions contained of 40 statements, distributed as the following: Active and collaborative learning (7 item). Student effort (10items). Academic challenge (11item) Student-faculty interaction (6 items), and Support for (6 items) learners

❖ Scoring system

Responses of participants were measured at 3 points Likert scale ranged from very little, somewhat, and very much. Very much was scored as "3", while very little was scored as "1" for the items of some dimensions, while the items of another dimension were scored ranged from very often, often, sometimes and never. Very often was scored as "4", while never was scored as "1". The negative

words got reversed score. All items are summed up and a mean score is calculated.

Engagement level of study subject when the behaviors considered a low level if the total score was less than 25%. While it's considered a moderate level if the total score was ranged from 25-75% and it's considered a high level if the total score more than 75%.

Pilot study:

A pilot study was conducted at the end of September, 2019. It was done on "20" nursing student selected randomly which represents approximately 10% of the main study subjects. A pilot study was done for testing the clarity and applicability of tools, and their relevance to study. It also helped to estimate the time needed to complete the data collection forms. Since there wasn't any change made in the tools, the study sample participated in pilot study.

Field work:

The fieldwork of the study lasted for Five months started from May 2019 till September 2019, and was completed by the end of July 2018. The study was concerned with assessment of nursing students' and civility behavior classroom engagement. The researcher introducing herself to participants, then the components of questionnaire sheet were explained to them. who were assured that information collected would be used for scientific research only and would be confidential. The researcher distributed the questionnaire sheet to participants and also, researcher was present with them in their classroom two days every week (2hrs/day). The subjects were filled in at the time of distribution, completed during day duty, and their filling in took about 25-30 minutes. The researcher checked each questionnaire sheet after being completed by each participant to ensure completion of all information.

Administrative Design:

Before any attempt to collect data, an official approval to conduct the study was obtained from Dean of nursing faculty. This was done by issuing letters from the vice of the student affairs Faculty of Nursing clarifying the aim of the study to the head of medical surgical nursing department.

Ethical consideration:

Prior to the actual work of research study, ethical approval was obtained from the Scientific Research Ethical Committee of the Faculty of Nursing at Ain Shams University. The aim of the study and benefits were explained to all study participants to obtain their oral permission and cooperation for collecting data.

The subjects were informed about their right to withdraw at any time and they were reassured that any obtained information would be confidential, and used for the purpose of research.

Statistical Design

The data collected were revised. coded analyzed, tabulated and statistical by using number and percentage distribution. Student t-test was used to assess the statistical significance of the difference of a parametric variable between means of two study groups (two independent group Statistical significance means). considered at p value < 0.05, and highly statistically significant (HS) was considered at P<0.01.

Results:

Table (1): shows that, 57.5%more than half of nursing students were female, 69%of them had the second birth order. 92.5%Majority of father were employee. 70% of mothers were housewives, 77% of father had high qualified education level. While 50%half of mothers had middle level of education, and 88% majority of them had desire to enroll in faculty.

Table (2): shows that more than half (55%) of nursing students had uncivil behavior while less than one third (27,5%) of nursing students had civil behavior.

Table (3): shows that two fifth (40%) of nursing students had low level of classroom engagement while less than half (42%) of nursing students had high level of classroom engagement.

Table (4): presents that 79.5% majority of nursing student perceived disagreeable behaviors was never while 61.5% more than three fifth of nursing students perceived disregard of other behaviors was always.

Table (5): shows that there was highly statistically significant relation between nursing students' civility behavior and all classroom engagement areas p<0.01.

Table (1): Socio-demographic characteristics of nursing students in the study sample (n=200).

| | Francisco of nursing students in the study sample (n=200). | | | | |
|--------------------------------------|--|---------|--|--|--|
| ~ . | Frequency | Percent | | | |
| Gender: | | | | | |
| Male | 85 | 42.5 | | | |
| Female | 115 | 57.5 | | | |
| Birth order: | | | | | |
| 1 | 62 | 31 | | | |
| 2+ | 138 | 69 | | | |
| Range | | 1-6 | | | |
| Mean±SD | 2. | 2±1.3 | | | |
| Median | | 2.0 | | | |
| Father employment | | | | | |
| Employee | 185 | 92.5 | | | |
| Unemployed | 15 | 7.5 | | | |
| Mother employment | | | | | |
| Employee | 60 | 30 | | | |
| House wife | 140 | 70 | | | |
| Fathers' education level | | | | | |
| High qualified | 154 | 77 | | | |
| Middle level | 39 | 19.5 | | | |
| Illiterate | 7 | 3.5 | | | |
| Mothers' education level | | | | | |
| High qualified | 63 | 31.5 | | | |
| Middle level | 100 | 50.0 | | | |
| Illiterate | 37 | 18.5 | | | |
| Have you been enrolled in faculty at | | | | | |
| your desire? | | | | | |
| Yes | 176 | 88 | | | |
| No | 24 | 12 | | | |

Table (2): Frequency and percentage distribution of nursing students' civility behavior level (n=200).

| Civility behavior | Levels | Percent | age |
|------------------------------|-----------|---------|-------|
| | | No | % |
| Avoidance behaviors | Civil | 40 | 20% |
| | Uncertain | 29 | 14,5% |
| | Uncivil | 131 | 65,5% |
| Disregard of other behaviors | Civil | 40 | 20% |
| | Uncertain | 30 | 15% |
| | Uncivil | 130 | 65% |
| Violation of ethic behaviors | Civil | 60 | 30% |
| | Uncertain | 16 | 8% |
| | Uncivil | 124 | 62% |
| Aggressive behaviors | Civil | 18 | 9% |
| | Uncertain | 22 | 11% |
| | Uncivil | 160 | 80% |
| Disagreeable behaviors | Civil | 30 | 15% |
| | Uncertain | 43 | 21,5% |
| | Uncivil | 127 | 63,5% |
| Total | Civil | 55 | 27,5% |
| | Uncertain | 35 | 17,5% |
| | Uncivil | 110 | 55% |

Table (3):Frequency and percentage distribution of nursing students' classroom

engagement level (n=200).

| Student Engagement | Levels | Percent | Percentage | | |
|-----------------------------|----------|---------|------------|--|--|
| | | No | % | | |
| | High | 126 | 63% | | |
| Active and collaborative | moderate | 24 | 12% | | |
| | Low | 50 | 25% | | |
| learning | High | 50 | 25% | | |
| Student effort | moderate | 30 | 15% | | |
| Academic | Low | 120 | 60% | | |
| Challenge | High | 75 | 37,5% | | |
| Student-faculty interaction | moderate | 25 | 12,5% | | |
| · | Low | 100 | 50% | | |
| Student-faculty interaction | High | 90 | 45% | | |
| | moderate | 30 | 15% | | |
| | Low | 80 | 40% | | |
| | High | 84 | 42% | | |
| Support for learners | moderate | 26 | 13% | | |
| | Low | 90 | 45% | | |
| Total | High | 84 | 42% | | |
| | moderate | 36 | 18% | | |
| | Low | 80 | 40% | | |

Table (4): Frequency occurrence of civility behaviors as perceived by studied nursing students' (n=200).

| Civility behaviors | Alv | Always | | etimes | Never | |
|------------------------------|-----|--------|----|--------|-------|------|
| | No | % | No | % | No | % |
| Avoidance behaviors | 116 | 58 | 41 | 20.5 | 43 | 21.5 |
| Disregard of other behaviors | 123 | 61.5 | 41 | 20.5 | 36 | 18 |
| Violation of ethic behaviors | 119 | 59.5 | 53 | 26.5 | 28 | 14 |
| Aggressive behaviors | 43 | 21.5 | 13 | 6.5 | 144 | 72 |
| Disagreeable behaviors | 23 | 11.5 | 18 | 9 | 159 | 79.5 |

Table (5): The relations between studied nursing students' classroom engagement and civility behavior (n=200).

| Engagement | | | | | | | | |
|---|--------|-------|-----|----------------|-------|-------|---------|----------|
| Civility dimensions | High (| 75%+) | | te (25%- %) | Low (| <25%) | x² test | p-value |
| | No. | % | No. | % | No. | % | | |
| Avoidance behaviors | 127 | 63.5 | 120 | 60 | 95 | 47.8 | | |
| civil (75%+) | 40 | 20 | 57 | 28.6 | 70 | 34.7 | | |
| uncertain (60%-75%) uncivil (<60%) | 33 | 16.5 | 23 | 11.4 | 35 | 17.5 | 867 | 0.006** |
| Disregard of other | 134 | 67 | 57 | 28.6 | 104 | 52 | | |
| behaviors | 33 | 16.5 | 56 | 42.8 | 61 | 30.7 | | |
| civil (75%+) uncertain (60%-75%) | 33 | 16.5 | 57 | 28.6 | 35 | 17.3 | 1.78 | 0.003** |
| uncivil (<60%) | | | | | | | | |
| Violation of ethic | 106 | 53 | 108 | 54 | 70 | 34.8 | | |
| behaviors | 56 | 28 | 46 | 23 | 87 | 43.5 | | |
| civil (75%+) uncertain (60%-75%) uncivil (<60%) | 38 | 19 | 46 | 23 | 43 | 21.7 | 4.00 | 0.962 |
| Aggressive behaviors | 64 | 32 | 103 | 51.4 | 70 | 34.8 | | |
| civil (75%+) | 68 | 34 | 40 | 20 | 78 | 39 | | |
| uncertain (60%-75%) uncivil (<60%) | 68 | 34 | 57 | 28.6 | 52 | 26.2 | 1.16 | 0.004** |
| Disagreeable behaviors | 56 | 28 | 57 | 28.6 | 61 | 30.5 | | |
| civil (75%+) | 50 | 25 | 57 | 28.6 | 61 | 30.5 | | |
| uncertain (60%-75%) | 94 | 47 | 56 | 42.8 | 78 | 39 | 35.85 | <0.001** |
| uncivil (<60%) | | | | | | | | · |
| Total | | | | | | | | |
| civil (75%+) | 100 | 50 | 97 | 48.4 | 87 | 43.5 | | |
| uncertain (60%-75%) | 50 | 25 | 57 | 28.6 | 70 | 34.8 | 45.83 | <0.001** |
| uncivil (<60%) | 50 | 25 | 46 | 23 | 43 | 21.7 | | |

Discussion

Civility behavior is an important role in developing engagement, and higher education plays a special role in helping student develop a sense of civic responsibility. So, the classroom is a place where learning can take place in a positive environment. Academic institutions' primary mission focuses on learning. In addition to the relationship that civility has with learning in the academy, the consequences of nursing student civility on students and their engagement (Mohamed & Attia, 2020). The current study this study aims at assessing the relationship between civility behavior and classroom engagement among nursing students.

Regarding the socio-demographic characteristics of nursing students, the current study revealed that more than half of participants were females, more than two thirds of the nursing student's birth order had the second. The majority of father were employees. More than three quarters of father had a high qualified education level. While half of mother had a middle level of education, more than half of them were housewives and the majority of them had a desire to enroll in the faculty.

On the same line, this result agrees with **Mohamed**, (2018) who studied faculty staff versus nurses' students' perceptions regarding uncivil behavior in the classroom and found that the majority of father were employed and highly educated and mothers were housewives.

While, disagreeing with Nordstrom et al., (2009) who studied Predicting and Curbing Classroom Incivility in Higher Education found that students were the majority of male compared to females. Also, Joshua, (2014) who studied academic uncivil behaviors and its social and cultural context: students' and lecturer's perspectives in colleges of education in Nigeria and found that the majority of male included in the study.

Regarding nursing students' civility behavior, revealed that more than half of nursing students had uncivil

behavior while less than one third of nursing students had civil behavior. From the researcher point of view, this result may be due to decrease sense of ethical obligation and students need to help develop self-awareness skills and use advanced teaching methods and well-prepared education materials in addition to interesting, motivating and high concentration of nursing students to learn about civility.

On the same line, Clark, (2017) who studied student incivility radiography education and found that improve the level of civility after intervention to create and sustain healthy workplaces and to foster an atmosphere of dignity, professionalism, and respect." Also consistent with those of Zhu, et al. (2019), who conducted a study aimed to synthesize evidence for the experiences perceptions of incivility during clinical education of nursing students, and found that the total score of civility strategies' level for studied students was moderate.

Regarding nursing students about the classroom engagement, the current study revealed that two fifth of nursing students had low level of classroom engagement while less than half (42%) of nursing students had high level of classroom engagement. Might be due to the ignore importance of engagement for everyone and low interesting ability of all nursing students to be dominant in their future.

On the same level, **Taylor & Parsons**, **(2011)** who studied improving student engagement and found that the majority of students had improved knowledge of engagement after the intervention.

Regarding nursing students' frequency of the occurrence of civility behavior, the current study revealed that the majority of nursing students perceived disagreeable behaviors was never. While, more than three fifths of them perceived disregard of other behaviors was always. Might be due to the fact that knowledge regarding all civility dimensions needs

more time to control because the nursing students understand it first then try and try to comply, and finally acquire it.

This result supported by Abd Elkader et al., (2012) who studied that perception of unethical behaviors among nursing educators, students, and staff in Elminia, and found that the most perceived academic unethical behaviors by faculty members and nursing students were disagreeable behaviors and disregard for others. Also, Love, (2012) who supported the present study results and found that aggressive behavior, threatening behaviors were the least frequently occurring behaviors. Overall, minority of the sample reported experiencing aggressive.

relation to Regarding nursing student' level of civility and engagement, the current study revealed that there was highly statistically significant relation between nursing students' civility behavior and all classroom engagement areas. Might be due to explained as, when nursing students have a full view of civility behaviors leading to engagement, and use the appropriate teaching strategies to deal with such behavior, will lead to encourage and improve their engagement in the classroom, and these will be achieved through understanding the importance of civility culture and respect among each other's.

This result agrees with Clark (2013) who studied that the pedagogy of civility: innovative strategies to create an engaged learning environment, concluded that incivility is minimized when students are engaged in the learning experience. While disagreement with Kassem and Mohamed (2019) and Lutz (2016) who found that there was a significant negative significant relationship between degree of incivility behaviors and engagement level among the studied students.

Conclusion

This study was undertaken to assess the relationship between civility behavior and classroom engagement among nursing students. The study findings concluded that there was a highly statistically significant relation between nursing students' civility behavior and classroom engagement.

Recommendations

Based on the findings of the present study, the following recommendations are develop suggested that innovative teaching\learning strategies to improve the student engagement in the classroom. develop collaborative committees, including students and faculty to develop ideas and strategies to improve civility, develop offering students' opportunities to participate in both academic activities and peer interaction, and incorporate the civility into the syllabus and student guide booklet.

References

- Abd Elkader, A.M., Aref, S.M., and Abood, S.A. (2012): Perception of Unethical Behaviors among Nursing Educators, Students, and Staff in Elminia University, Journal of American Science; 8(12):74-79.
- Caroline, J.V. (2018): Student nurses' experiences of incivility and the impact on learning and emotional wellbeing. Journal of Nursing Education and Practice; 8(4): 104-106.
- Clark, C. (2013): The pedagogy of civility: innovative strategies to create an engaged learning environment; Available at: http://www.shawnee.edu.
- Clark, C.M. (2009): Faculty field guide for promoting student civility in the classroom. Nurse Educator Journal, 34: 194-197.
- Clark, C.M. (2017): An Evidence-Based Approach to Integrate Civility, Professionalism, and Ethical Practice Into Nursing Curricula" (published in the May/ June 2017 issue of Nurse Educator), ATI Strategic Nursing Advisor.
- Clark. C.M., Leiker, C.B., Gill, L. (2015): Revision and Psychometric Testing of The Incivility In Nursing Education (INE) Survey: Introducing the INE-R, Journal of Nursing Education; 54(6): 2015 31, DOI: 10.3928/01484834-20150515-01 Source: Pubmed

- Estell, D.B. & Perdue, N.H. (2013): Social Support and Behavioral and Affective School Engagement: The effects of Peers, parents, and Teachers. Psychology in the Schools; 50(4): 1-15.
- **Foreman, A.R. (2018):** Coping strategies of pre licensure registered nursing students experiencing student-to-student incivility. Advanced Practices in Nursing; 3: 2573-0347, 70.
- Joshua, N.J. (2014): Academic Uncivil behaviors and It's Social and Cultural Context: Students' and Lecturer's Perspectives in Colleges of Education in Nigeria, Dissertation of The Hong Kong Institute of Education, ProQuest Digital Dissertations Database. UMI, 3681295, PP: 15-35.
- Kassem, H.A., & Mohammed, A.B. (2019): Incivility behavior and engagement among Technical and Health Institute Nursing Students at the Classroom. International Journal of Nursing Didactics; 9 (05): 21-28.
- Keating, P. (2016): An Exploratory Mixed-Methods Study of Student Incivility in Higher Education Classrooms, Doctoral Dissertation, Edge Hill University P.P 50-54.
- **Love, K. (2012).** Higher education, pedagogy and the 'customerisation' of teaching and learning. Journal of Philosophy of Education, 42(1), 15-34.
- Lutz, S. (2016): Moderating effects of positive affect, negative affect, and incivility on students' engagement and exhaustion; Master thesis; University Librarian at Acadia University. Available at: http://cord.acadiau.ca/campus-civility.html.
- Mahmoud, S.A. (2015): Studying Civility among Nursing at Tanta University, Unpublished Master Thesis, Faculty of Nursing, at Tanta University, Pp. 2, 48.
- Mo, Y., & Singh, K. (2018): Parents' Relationships and Involvement: Effects on Students' School Engagement and Performance. RMLE Online: Research in Middle Level Education, 31(10), 1-11. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/19404476.2018.11462053

- Mohamed, A. & Attia, N. (2020): "Factors Associated with Incivility Behaviors, Coping Strategies and Level of Engagement among Post Graduate Nursing Students." IOSR Journal of Nursing and Health Science (IOSR-JNHS), 9(01), 2020, pp. 17-27.
- Mohamed, E.H. (2018): Faculty Staff Versus Nurse Students Perception Regarding Uncivil Behavior in the Classroom. Thesis of Master Degree Faculty of Nursing at Ain Shams University, pp 83.
- Natarajan, J., Muliira, J.K. & der Colff, J.V. (2017): Incidence and Perception of Nursing Students' Academic Incivility in Oman, BM Nursing Journal; 6(3): 3-9.
- National Survey of Student Engagement (2017): About NSSE. Retrieved from http://nsse.iub.edu/
- Nordstrom, C. R., Bartels, L. K., & Bucy, J. (2009): Predicting and Curbing Classroom Incivility inHigher Education. College Student Journal, 43, 74-85.
- Ogab, A., Huy, P., Phan, I. & Bing, H. (2016): Academic Engagement: An Overview of Its Definitions, Dimensions. and Major Conceptualizations, International Education Studies; Vol. 9, page No. 12; ISSN 1913-9020 E-ISSN 1913-9039 Published by Canadian Center of Science and Education 41, University of New England, Armidale, NSW, Australia.
- Ouweneel, E., Le Blanc, P.M., & Schaufeli, W.B. (2014): On being grateful and kind: Results of two randomized controlled trials on study-related emotions and academic engagement. The Journal of Psychology: Interdisciplinary and Applied, 148(1), 37-60. http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1080/00223980. 2012. 742854
- Taylor, L. & Parsons, J. (2011):
 Improving Student Engagement.
 Current Issues in Education, 14(1).
 Retrieved from http://cie.asu.edu/

- Todd, D., Byers, D., & Garth, K. (2016):
 A pilot study examining the effects of faculty incivility on nursing program satisfaction. BLDE University Journal of Health Sciences; 1(1): 9-13.
- Vink, H. & Adejumo, O. (2015): Factors contributing to incivility amongst students at a south African Nursing School; 38(1): 1464.
- Zhu, Z., Xing, W., Lizarondo, L., Guo, M., & Hu, Y. (2019): Nursing students" experiences with faculty incivility in the clinical education context: A qualitative systematic review and meta-synthesis; BMJ Open; 9(2): 024383.